

Americas

17. The question concerning Haiti

Overview

During the period 2012-2013, the Security Council held eight meetings in connection with the question concerning Haiti, including two closed meetings with countries contributing troops and police to the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH),⁵¹⁰ and adopted two resolutions under Chapter VII of the Charter. The Council heard semi-annual briefings by senior officials of the Organization on the situation on the ground, addressing political and security conditions, activities of MINUSTAH and humanitarian, recovery and development matters. The Council twice renewed the mandate of MINUSTAH for periods of one year,⁵¹¹ while at the same time reducing the force level. In addition, the Security Council mission visited Haiti from 13 to 16 February 2012.⁵¹²

The situation concerning Haiti and activities of MINUSTAH

On 8 March 2012, the Council heard a briefing by the Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Haiti and Head of MINUSTAH, who introduced the report of the Secretary-General of 29 February 2012.⁵¹³ He reported on the political situation, including the resignation of the Prime Minister, Garry Conille, after four months in office, and the continuing conflicts between the executive and legislative branches; the rule of law and security, including the establishment of the Supreme Court and efforts by MINUSTAH for strengthening the Haitian National Police; the socio-economic, humanitarian and human rights situation; and the tackling of the cholera epidemic. He also reported that the reduction of the military and police components of MINUSTAH in accordance with resolution 2012 (2011) was to be completed by June.⁵¹⁴

Speakers were generally concerned about the political stalemate and urged the Government to engage in political dialogue and to hold the next partial legislative, municipal and local elections as soon as possible. While acknowledging the relatively stable security situation and the progress in the areas of the rule of law and recovery and reconstruction since the earthquake of January 2010, many speakers also stressed the need for more progress, particularly in the strengthening and capacity-building of the national police — to which MINUSTAH had been contributing — and in resettling the displaced population and protecting vulnerable groups. Several speakers expressed concerns over the resurfacing of armed former members of the Haitian armed forces, which had been dissolved in 1995. The representative of Haiti hoped that his country would no longer figure in United Nations reports and resolutions as a “threat to international peace and security” as that phrase struck fear in potential investors.⁵¹⁵

A number of speakers opined that the size and the mandate of the future MINUSTAH should be considered on the basis of conditions on the ground, particularly the ability of the national police to take on greater responsibility. The representative of the Russian Federation was pleased that the reconfiguration of the Mission was going according to plan and said that, once the reform process was concluded, the Council could assess the effectiveness of the implementation of its mandate under Chapter VII of the Charter and possibly consider additional measures.⁵¹⁶ In view of the allegations of sexual misconduct by the personnel of the Mission, speakers underscored the need for the United Nations to ensure compliance with its zero-tolerance policy on sexual exploitation and abuse.

On 3 October 2012, introducing the report of the Secretary-General of 31 August 2012,⁵¹⁷ the Special Representative of the Secretary-General briefed the Council on a wide range of issues, including the positive developments in the political stabilization

⁵¹⁰ See [S/PV.6833](#) and [S/PV.7023](#).

⁵¹¹ See resolutions [2070 \(2012\)](#) and [2119 \(2013\)](#). For more information on the mandate of MINUSTAH, see part X, sect. I, “Peacekeeping operations”.

⁵¹² See part I, sect. 34, “Security Council mission”.

⁵¹³ [S/2012/128](#).

⁵¹⁴ [S/PV.6732](#), pp. 2-5.

⁵¹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 21.

⁵¹⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 16.

⁵¹⁷ [S/2012/678](#).

process and the rule of law in Haiti, namely the confirmation by Parliament of the new Prime Minister, Laurent Lamothe, and the establishment of the Superior Council of the Judiciary overseeing the transparency and independence of the judiciary. At the same time he reported a serious impasse in the formation of the Permanent Electoral Council responsible for organizing all elections in Haiti according to constitutional provisions. He further reported that the illegal activities of former members of the Haitian army were no longer an issue of concern, as the Haitian police, with the support of MINUSTAH, had evicted those calling for the re-establishment of the army and the payment of pensions from the 10 sites that they had occupied. Turning to the strengthening of the police, he stated that the Superior Council of the Haitian National Police had endorsed the 2012-2016 plan for the police which, among other measures, called for the training of at least 1,200 new officers a year to create a police force made up of more than 15,000 officers in total. He reiterated the recommendation of the Secretary-General in his report to reduce the authorized strength of troops from 7,340 to 6,270 and the police from 3,241 to 2,601, with a consequent drop in civilian personnel in accordance with the reduced scope of the activities of the Mission. He further announced that MINUSTAH, together with the United Nations country team, had consulted the Government of Haiti on the conditions-based consolidation plan, which was in a working phase at that moment, so as to facilitate the concentration and reduction of the activities of MINUSTAH in a rational fashion and to head towards a final state of the Mission.⁵¹⁸

Speakers were encouraged by the more promising picture represented by the swearing-in of a new Government, the publication of the constitutional amendments and the establishment of the Superior Council of the Judiciary, which paved the way towards the formation of the Permanent Electoral Council. With regard to the former armed forces, many speakers also welcomed the progress on the security front as well as the increased performance of the national police, including a handover of security from MINUSTAH to the police in camps of internally displaced people. There was a general consensus on the renewal of the mandate of MINUSTAH for one year as the Secretary-General had recommended. Many speakers were also

supportive of the recommendation of the Secretary-General concerning the reconfiguration and consolidation of MINUSTAH as envisaged in the 2013-2016 consolidation plan. At the same time, several speakers underlined the necessity to draw down MINUSTAH carefully and on the basis of the conditions on the ground, not of a fixed timeline, without undermining the gains achieved thus far. A few speakers underscored the contribution of and the importance of maintaining the engineering component as well as quick-impact and community violence reduction projects,⁵¹⁹ while others maintained that some of the tasks of MINUSTAH should be handed over to other actors, including national ones.⁵²⁰

At its 6845th meeting, on 12 October 2012, the Council unanimously adopted resolution 2070 (2012), in which it commended the wide range of recovery efforts delivered in the aftermath of the January 2010 earthquake by the United Nations system in Haiti, especially the United Nations-supported housing and debris removal programmes and the successful use of the military engineering units of MINUSTAH. Acting under Chapter VII of the Charter, the Council extended the mandate of MINUSTAH until 15 October 2013, while reducing the overall force level of the Mission to 6,270 troops and 2,601 police personnel. The Council took note of the conditions-based consolidation plan of MINUSTAH, and acknowledged the value of focusing the activities of the Mission on a core set of mandated tasks achievable within a reasonable time frame. It also recognized that a stable political and institutional environment was crucial for stability and the progress of recovery and reconstruction efforts, and called upon all the relevant political actors in Haiti to work cooperatively for the installation of the country's Permanent Electoral Council as established in the constitutional amendments and for the realization of the partial legislative, municipal and local elections that were now overdue.

On 20 March 2013, in presenting the political, socioeconomic and security situations in Haiti in line with the report of the Secretary-General dated 8 March 2013,⁵²¹ the Acting Special Representative of the Secretary-General stated that the six-month

⁵¹⁸ S/PV.6842, pp. 2-6.

⁵¹⁹ Ibid., pp. 17-18 (Colombia); p. 20 (South Africa); p. 24 (Brazil); and p. 29 (Chile).

⁵²⁰ Ibid., pp. 20-21 (United Kingdom); and p. 21 (Russian Federation).

⁵²¹ S/2013/139.

reporting period had been one of impasse in the political domain, epitomized by the lack of progress in creating the electoral council. The MINUSTAH consolidation plan,⁵²² as had been agreed with the Government of Haiti, outlined four key objectives for the three years from 2013 to 2016, namely, accelerated development of the national police; strengthening of a permanent electoral council once it was created; strengthening of the rule of law and respect for human rights, with a priority on reinforcing basic accountability and oversight mechanisms; and supporting key national and local governance reforms, as well as helping key national stakeholders to achieve consensus on inclusive political processes and institutional reforms to create conditions for socioeconomic development. The consolidation plan also set out a limited number of benchmarks for each of the four areas that could be realistically attained by 2016.⁵²³

Most speakers emphasized the importance of holding free, fair, inclusive and credible local, municipal and senatorial elections by the end of 2013, which would bolster stability and socioeconomic development, and urged political leaders to avoid further delays. Speakers also highlighted the ongoing need to strengthen the capacity of the national police as one of the priorities for MINUSTAH and called for the continued assistance of the international community for support to create professional police forces. The conditions-based consolidation plan for MINUSTAH was welcomed by the majority of speakers. The representative of the United States considered the consolidation plan as a living document that would evolve in response to developments on the ground and adjustments to the MINUSTAH mandate.⁵²⁴ The representative of the Russian Federation stated that, while his delegation supported the proposal to focus the mandate of the Mission on a number of attainable objectives, the announced goals and measurement indicators were ambitious and required future discussion among Council members.⁵²⁵ The representative of Mexico was concerned that the actions that had been successful in the past, such as the

quick-impact projects, had been left out in the consolidation plan.⁵²⁶

The representative of Guatemala opined that the mandate of MINUSTAH should determine its budget, not the other way around and argued that there should be no further reductions in the number of uniformed personnel.⁵²⁷ Similarly, the representative of Brazil maintained that financial consideration must not be the driving force behind the reduction of the United Nations presence in Haiti.⁵²⁸ The representative of France held that, while a hasty departure should be avoided, the indefinite continuation of a peacekeeping operation of that magnitude was not an option and the prospect of its departure should serve as a catalyst.⁵²⁹

On 28 August 2013, the Special Representative of the Secretary-General, in her briefing, stated that the overall security situation in Haiti had remained relatively stable with a decrease in both civil unrest and major crimes, and that further strengthening of the police remained a critical stabilization benchmark. The continued delay in the holding of long-overdue elections was a source of increasing concern, as scepticism regarding the likelihood of holding the elections in 2013 rose, posing a series of risks to the stabilization process. On the consolidation plan of the Mission, the Special Representative reported that the military and police components of MINUSTAH had completed the mandated reduction of their personnel in accordance with resolution 2070 (2012). She further stated that the President, Joseph Martelly, and the Prime Minister had expressed support for a phased withdrawal of the Mission as the capacity of national institutions increased. She concluded that Haiti was at a critical juncture, as progress in security and stabilization and economic development could be jeopardized by the instability resulting from the polarization linked to the election stalemate, and that therefore MINUSTAH continued to work to convince national stakeholders to hold elections as soon as possible and to agree that the continuity of institutions was in their best interest and that of the nation.⁵³⁰

Speakers in general recognized the steps that Haiti had taken towards stabilization, such as the

⁵²² Ibid., annex.

⁵²³ [S/PV.6936](#), pp. 2-4.

⁵²⁴ Ibid., p. 5.

⁵²⁵ Ibid., p. 19.

⁵²⁶ Ibid., p. 27.

⁵²⁷ Ibid., p. 12.

⁵²⁸ Ibid., p. 22.

⁵²⁹ Ibid., p. 16.

⁵³⁰ [S/PV.7024](#), pp. 2-4.

establishment of the Transitional College of the Permanent Electoral Council and the submission of a draft electoral law to the Parliament, which were important to the holding of long-overdue elections. Many speakers also were aware of the remaining challenges in the process of electoral preparation and reiterated their call to hold the elections as soon as possible, urging the political actors to reach consensus and to create the necessary conditions for elections to be held. They also stressed the need to end the climate of impunity, to support the national police in accordance with the 2012-2016 development plan, and to address the humanitarian situation in the country.

Speakers also supported the recommendations of the Secretary-General to extend the mandate of MINUSTAH for another year and to further reduce the troop strength by 15 per cent, some emphasizing the necessity to do so carefully, in line with the security and political conditions. The representative of the United States agreed with the withdrawal, provided that MINUSTAH maintained a robust, quick-reaction capacity.⁵³¹ The representative of the United Kingdom reiterated his delegation's position that the tasks undertaken by the engineering units in supporting quick-impact projects, such as road repair, well-drilling, draining and canal cleaning and water distribution, should be handed over to others, including the local private sector,⁵³² while others underlined the utility of the quick-impact and community violence reduction programmes,⁵³³ some explicitly calling for the continuation of those programmes by MINUSTAH.⁵³⁴ The representative of the United Kingdom also welcomed the decision of the Secretary-General to explore the option of a transition to a smaller, more focused assistance mission by 2016, while stressing that the Mission's continuing presence in Haiti remained necessary for now and that any significant change to the configuration should come with credible benchmarks to ensure the capacity of the Government of Haiti to shoulder increasing responsibility.⁵³⁵ The representative of the Russian Federation also supported the Secretary-General's proposals to consolidate MINUSTAH and its transformation into a smaller mission with a narrower

mandate.⁵³⁶ The representative of Guatemala held that withdrawal of MINUSTAH must be done in a responsible manner to ensure that the Mission would never have to return.⁵³⁷ In a similar vein, the representative of Haiti emphasized the importance of considering all possible scenarios for disengagement in order to avoid a repetition of history, while welcoming the fact that the Council had determined that Haiti no longer constituted a threat to international peace and security.⁵³⁸

At its 7040th meeting, on 10 October 2013, the Council unanimously adopted resolution [2119 \(2013\)](#) in which it noted with concern that election preparations were still experiencing delays which could affect the holding of elections in 2013. Acting under Chapter VII of the Charter, it extended the mandate of MINUSTAH until 15 October 2014 and reduced further the overall force level to 5,021 troops, while retaining the police at 2,601 personnel. The Council also requested MINUSTAH to continue to implement quick-impact projects that contributed to building a secure and stable environment and enhanced national ownership and the trust of the Haitian population towards MINUSTAH, as well as to pursue its community violence reduction approach. It also took note of the ongoing implementation of the conditions-based consolidation plan of MINUSTAH and welcomed the efforts by the Special Representative of the Secretary-General to support the political process under way in Haiti.

After the adoption of the resolution, the representative of the United Kingdom said that MINUSTAH was the clearest example of a mismatch between the needs on the ground and the tools available to the Council to address them, in view of the fact that over 5,000 military personnel would be in a country where there had been no military conflict in recent times. He added that, after 10 years, the time for quick-impact projects was long past; he supported the drawdown of the Mission and believed there was scope for a more accelerated drawdown, in particular of engineering personnel.⁵³⁹

⁵³¹ Ibid., p. 5.

⁵³² Ibid., p. 12.

⁵³³ Ibid., p. 11 (Rwanda); p. 24 (Brazil); and p. 31 (Chile).

⁵³⁴ Ibid., p. 5 (United States); and p. 25 (Mexico).

⁵³⁵ Ibid., p. 12.

⁵³⁶ Ibid., p. 14.

⁵³⁷ Ibid., p. 16.

⁵³⁸ Ibid., p. 21.

⁵³⁹ [S/PV.7040](#), p. 2.

Meetings: the question concerning Haiti

<i>Meeting record and date</i>	<i>Sub-item</i>	<i>Other documents</i>	<i>Rule 37 invitations</i>	<i>Rule 39 and other invitations</i>	<i>Speakers</i>	<i>Decision and vote (for-against-abstaining)</i>
S/PV.6732 8 March 2012	Report of the Secretary-General on the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH) (S/2012/128)		Brazil, Canada, Chile, Haiti, Japan, Peru, Senegal, Spain, Uruguay	Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Haiti and Head of MINUSTAH, Head of the Delegation of the European Union to the United Nations	All Council members, all invitees ^a	
S/PV.6842 3 October 2012	Report of the Secretary-General on MINUSTAH (S/2012/678)		Argentina, Brazil, Canada, Chile, Ecuador, Haiti, Japan, Mexico, Peru, Spain, Uruguay	Special Representative of the Secretary-General and Head of MINUSTAH, Head of the Delegation of the European Union	All Council members, ^b all invitees ^c	
S/PV.6845 12 October 2012	Report of the Secretary-General on MINUSTAH (S/2012/678)	Draft resolution submitted by Argentina, Brazil, Canada, Chile, Colombia, France, Guatemala, Paraguay, Peru, Spain, United States, Uruguay (S/2012/743)	Argentina, Brazil, Canada, Chile, Haiti, Paraguay, Peru, Spain, Uruguay			Resolution 2070 (2012) 15-0-0 (adopted under Chapter VII)
S/PV.6936 20 March 2013	Report of the Secretary-General on MINUSTAH (S/2013/139)		Brazil, Canada, Chile, Haiti, Japan, Mexico, Peru, Spain, Uruguay	Acting Special Representative of the Secretary-General and Interim Head of MINUSTAH, Head of the Delegation of the European Union	All Council members, ^b all invitees ^d	
S/PV.7024 28 August 2013	Report of the Secretary-General on MINUSTAH (S/2013/493)		Brazil, Canada, Chile, Colombia, Haiti, Japan, Mexico, Peru, Spain, Trinidad and Tobago, Uruguay	Special Representative of the Secretary-General and Head of MINUSTAH, Deputy Head of the Delegation of the European Union	All Council members, all invitees ^d	

<i>Meeting record and date</i>	<i>Sub-item</i>	<i>Other documents</i>	<i>Rule 37 invitations</i>	<i>Rule 39 and other invitations</i>	<i>Speakers</i>	<i>Decision and vote (for-against-abstaining)</i>
S/PV.7040 10 October 2013	Report of the Secretary-General on MINUSTAH (S/2013/493)	Draft resolution submitted by Argentina, Brazil, Canada, Chile, France, Guatemala, Morocco, Peru, Rwanda, Togo, United States, Uruguay (S/2013/597)	Brazil, Canada, Chile, Haiti, Peru, Uruguay		United Kingdom	Resolution 2119 (2013) 15-0-0 (adopted under Chapter VII)

^a The representative of Uruguay spoke on behalf of the Group of Friends of Haiti, comprising Argentina, Brazil, Canada, Chile, Colombia, France, Guatemala, Peru, the United States and Uruguay. The Head of the Delegation of the European Union to the United Nations spoke on behalf of the States members of the European Union; Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Iceland, Montenegro, the Republic of Moldova, Serbia, the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Turkey and Ukraine aligned themselves with his statement.

^b Guatemala was represented by its Minister for Foreign Affairs.

^c The representative of Uruguay spoke on behalf of the Group of Friends of Haiti. The Head of the Delegation of the European Union spoke on behalf of the States members of the European Union; Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Georgia, Iceland, Montenegro, the Republic of Moldova, Serbia and the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia aligned themselves with his statement.

^d The representative of Uruguay spoke on behalf of the Group of Friends of Haiti. The deputy Head of the Delegation of the European Union spoke on behalf of the States members of the European Union; Albania, Armenia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Montenegro, the Republic of Moldova, Serbia, the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia and Ukraine aligned themselves with his statement.

^e The representative of Uruguay spoke on behalf of the Group of Friends of Haiti. The Head of the Delegation of the European Union spoke on behalf of the States members of the European Union; Albania, Armenia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Montenegro, Serbia, the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Turkey and Ukraine aligned themselves with his statement. The representative of Trinidad and Tobago spoke on behalf of the 14 States members of the Caribbean Community.

Asia

18. The situation in Timor-Leste

Overview

During the period under review, the Security Council held five meetings in connection with the situation in Timor-Leste, including one closed meeting with the troop-contributing countries,⁵⁴⁰ and adopted one resolution and one presidential statement. The Council received briefings from the Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Timor-Leste and Head of the United Nations Integrated Mission in Timor-Leste (UNMIT), the President of Timor-Leste, and the Acting Special Representative of the Secretary-General and Head of UNMIT. The Council focused on the efforts to transfer the functions of UNMIT to the Timorese authorities in preparation for the Mission's withdrawal at the end of 2012, on the preparations for the presidential and parliamentary elections due in the first half of 2012, on the downsizing process of the police component of the Mission after the elections and on the role of the United Nations in the country following the departure of the Mission. There were no meetings on this item in 2013.

On 23 February 2012, the Council extended the mandate of UNMIT⁵⁴¹ until the end of that year and endorsed the Secretary-General's plan of its phased drawdown.⁵⁴² In line with the Secretary-General's recommendation, UNMIT was terminated on 19 December 2012.⁵⁴³ The Council carried out a mission to Timor-Leste from 3 to 6 November 2012.⁵⁴⁴

Briefing on transition planning and final renewal of UNMIT mandate

On 22 February 2012, the Special Representative of the Secretary-General and Head of UNMIT reported that Timor-Leste had made significant strides in

advancing peace and stability and that, in the light of the overall stable situation, the closing of UNMIT continued to be planned for the end of 2012 and the post-2012 engagement of the United Nations in the country was already being discussed. She provided an overview of the preparations for the presidential and parliamentary elections to be held on 17 March and late in June 2012 respectively, and the operational support provided by UNMIT in this context. Regarding the transition of UNMIT, the Special Representative commended the efforts by the Government and the Mission in advancing the implementation of the Joint Transition Plan, noting that the main challenge was to ensure that institutions taking on new responsibilities had sufficient capacity and funding to carry them out effectively.⁵⁴⁵

The President of Timor-Leste informed the Council that, after a number of initiatives had been taken by his Office to address the root causes of the 2006 crisis, peace was palpable in Timor-Leste. While acknowledging that too much remained to be realized, he stated that the country would not have come so far without the generous assistance of the United Nations through UNMIT, specialized agencies and programmes, as well as of their bilateral partners and neighbours. He outlined the main achievements in the 10 years since Timor-Leste had become an independent country, in different areas including human, social and economic development, good governance and human rights. He underscored the contributions of UNMIT since its establishment in 2006, especially in the areas of good offices and public security and policing. He declared that, by the end of 2012, the goal was to see peacekeeping come to a close and to form a new partnership with the United Nations, underpinned by a modest mission tailored to the specific needs and priorities of Timor-Leste, to be decided by the newly elected Government. He said that a High-level Committee on Transition chaired by himself with the support of the Prime Minister and the Special Representative had been established; the emerging consensus was that the United Nations role could include support to further enhance democratic

⁵⁴⁰ See [S/PV.6714](#).

⁵⁴¹ For more information on the mandate of UNMIT, see part X, sect. I, "Peacekeeping operations".

⁵⁴² See resolution [2037 \(2012\)](#)

⁵⁴³ See [S/PRST/2012/27](#).

⁵⁴⁴ For information on the Security Council mission to Timor-Leste, see part I, sect. 34, "Security Council mission"; and part VI, sect. II, "Investigation of disputes and fact-finding".

⁵⁴⁵ [S/PV.6720](#), pp. 2-4.